Dear Editor,

Reference to Article No. 629

Title: Prevalence of paratuberculosis in water buffaloes on four public livestock farms of Punjab Pakistan.

Thank you for your early evaluation of the paper and the response to comments of the reviewer are as below:

Reviewer C:

1. More details about methodology......

The necessary detail has been added

2. Key words,

suggested key words ZN and Tuberculin have been added

3. The bibliography list needs some attention....

The bibliography has been corrected

Reviewer D:

1. Paratuberculosis is a disease which is considered to be of zoonotic importance

This is a cited quote in the introduction and the reference is given so we are not saying on our own

2. This disease

The correction has been made

3. CD is only in human....

Yes we have written the same and we tried to say that this disease has a possible link with paratuberculosis agent which the other authors are saying and we have cited their reference

4. This is a horizontally transmitted disease

It is corrected and disease agent has been related

5. Did some animal showed signs, font issue...

A statement has been added about clinical signs and font is corrected

6. gm

corrected to gram

7. I did not understand:

-ZN faecal samples - All Mycobacterium spp are positive ZN, so this doesn,t mean MAP

-Why do you use avium PPD? I think it is necessary to explain better

Yes, all Mycobacterium spp stain ZN positive but we are comapring them with results of avian PPD and ELISA so there these results become more or less specific.

The avian PPD was used for screening purpose and the positive animals were further tested by ELISA as ELISA is an expensive test so was only used to confirm the results by avian PPD.

8. Why do you compared with small ruminant if you worked with buffalos the comparison has been deleted and updated

9. But this is the first ever report on paratuberculosis in buffaloes on the public livestock farm which indicate the ELISA is used to diagnose paratuberculosis in animals and yes it targets the MAP antibodies and is understood fact, so we belief it is ok here

10. The results confirmed that keeping multiple species of animals on the farm is a risk factor for both tuberculosis and paratuberuclosis.

A statement has been added at the end of the sentence

The manuscript has been resubmitted to your journal. the changes in the text are indicated in blue. We look forward to your positive response.

Taining w

Prof. Dr. M. Tariq Javed